

ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC  
CO-OPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT

NUCLEAR ENERGY AGENCY

STEERING COMMITTEE  
FOR NUCLEAR ENERGY

RESTRICTED

Paris, drafted: 10-Avr-1995

OLIS: 13-Apr-1995

dist.: 18-Apr-1995

NEA/NSC/DOC(95)4

English text only

NUCLEAR SCIENCE COMMITTEE

Criticality Safety Studies

(Note by the Secretariat)

020829



## Criticality Safety Studies

### I. Introduction

1. The following activities have been carried out at NEA regarding out-of-pile criticality safety:

- . Criticality of Nuclear Fuel Transportation/Storage Packages (1980-84)
- . Criticality of Fuel Undergoing Dissolution (1986-90)
- . Burnup Credit Criticality Benchmarks (1991-

2. A recent publication, "The Safety of the Nuclear Fuel Cycle", (1992) gives a general overview of the safety issues and procedures in Member countries; it includes also a chapter on regulatory issues.

3. An incident reporting system specific to significant events from the fuel cycle has been set up recently: FINAS (Fuel Incident Notification and Analysis System)

4. An international working group, reporting to the Nuclear Science Committee carries out the work programme in the specific field of criticality safety. The main effort concentrates on benchmark studies of interest to Member countries.

5. The participants to the present phase of the work programme are listed in Annex I.

### II. Criticality Benchmarks

6. Several studies were carried out in which participants examined the ability of a variety of computational methods to accurately compute criticality for systems which have been measured to be experimentally critical.

- The first phase was oriented toward criticality safety of transport packages containing fissile material
- The second towards the criticality safety of dissolving fuel elements for fuel reprocessing and
- The third concentrates on the different aspects of burnup credit

The list of references to the publications summarizing the results is given as Annex II.

7. A procedure evolved from this work which has been shown to demonstrate whether a given computation method produces "valid" results. This procedure is expected to provide a basis for acceptance of computational results on an international basis by regulatory authorities through the comparison of methods used by various countries.

## II.1 Criticality of Fuel Undergoing Dissolution

8. The results from the study using of eighteen experimental benchmarks were consolidated in a report. Three calculational benchmarks on criticality codes for dissolving fissile oxides in acids have also been published. A particular difficult problem proved to be the treatment of fuel double heterogeneities (solid fissile material surrounded by fissile material in solution). A reference calculational method for self-shielding effects of resonances was identified for this type of problem.

## II.2 Burnup Credit Criticality Benchmarks

9. Burnup credit refers to including the predicted fuel composition (as a result of its utilisation in the reactor) in the evaluation of criticality safety limits in applications away from the reactor.

10. The standard approach used for the development and certification of spent fuel storage and transport packages is based on a fresh fuel assumption for the criticality safety analysis as it is the most reactive situation. There is a considerable reduction in reactivity if one takes credit for the burned state of the fuel. A higher payload can be achieved for instance for transportation packages thus diminishing the number of shipments which has advantages both from the economic and radiation protection point of view. In other words a balance is sought between reducing costs by improving plant and storage efficiency and optimal criticality safety by adopting realistic and well quantified safety margins and reducing hazards to populations by decreasing the number of spent fuel shipments.

11. The purpose of burnup credit studies is to demonstrate that appropriate procedures and techniques are available to ensure that the level of safety in current cask designs is not compromised.

12. The final objective is to produce state-of-the-art reports on the evaluation procedures for spent fuel system reactivity taking into account the isotopic composition and the non-uniform burning of the fuel.

### Achievements:

13. A first benchmark investigating trends in criticality as a function of initial enrichment, burnup and decay time of a simple PWR spent fuel cell was completed. Safety margins were identified assuming different simplifying assumptions and in particular the effect of major and minor actinides and major and minor fission products. A satisfactory agreement among participants was achieved and the final report has been published.

14. The second benchmark addresses spent fuel isotopic inventories, another source of uncertainty in criticality calculations. Discrepancies found in a first iteration have been resolved now. The report will be published in the course of 1995.

15. The third benchmark concerns the effect of axial burnup in an infinite array of PWR pin cells. The results confirm that the reactivity effect due to axial burnup increases with burnup and cooling times. The final report will be published at the beginning of 1995.

16. An agreement was found on a benchmark with a realistic configuration such as PWR spent fuel assemblies in a cask geometry. This problem will be studied in the course of the coming year.

Future work:

17. Topics for future work will include:

- . Evaluation of subcritical benchmarks:  
Nuclear data sets are often adjusted for  $k=1$  and their reliability for  $k=0.95$  needs to be verified.
- . Burnup credit criticality in BWRs: No clear conclusion was drawn as to the advantage of burnup credit for transport purposes. The general feeling was that it is important for spent BWR fuel storage. A benchmark specification has been submitted.
- . Burnup credit of MOX fuels
- . Radial pin burnup effects
- . Benchmark calculation of basic minimum critical values

III. Other Activities in Support of Criticality Safety

18. International criticality safety handbook/data base with criticality experiments:

This handbook will be the result of the compilation of data from experiments into a standard and the validation process of computer codes against them. Several countries are working on a national version of the handbook and there is now a general agreement that the international edition should combine these efforts to the benefit of the international community. The project is called "International Criticality Safety Benchmark Evaluation Project (ICSBEP)". The programme manager is D.Y. Chung (US DOE) and the project manager J.B. Briggs (INEL). In all there are approximately 60 participants.

US DOE has asked NEA to include this activity as an official activity of the NEA. The proposal was discussed at the NSC Bureau in December 1994 who appreciated the high interest of the data evaluated in the project and considered the involvement of the NEA-NSC appropriate. However, it was also agreed that a possible transfer to the NEA of the full responsibility for handbook updating could be discussed at the next NSC meeting following an evaluation of conditions and implications of such a transfer.

The handbook will be available both in paper and electronic form and its first edition will be published in May 1995 with the title: "International Handbook of Evaluated Criticality Safety Benchmark Experiments", NEA/NSC/DOC(95)03/I-VII.

19. Data base on isotopic inventories in spent fuel for criticality safety code validation:

An international data base of spent fuel assay, nuclide composition data with burnup history, for criticality safety benchmark studies was set up. This work is coordinated by JAERI the data base (SFCOMPCO) contains at present data from 13 LWRs (7 PWRs and 6 BWRs) located in Europe, Japan and USA. It will be supplemented with data from different countries so that it covers a wider scope; it is available to the international community.

20. Data base of basic quantities characterizing critical systems (cross sections, fission spectra, spectra of typical spent fuel systems) as needed by the most widely used criticality safety computer codes: objective: to facilitate comparisons and identify sources of discrepancy.

21. Experts' meeting on future needs for experiments in criticality safety, Las Vegas, September 1995:

Member countries' needs and concern of continued support for experiments and computational methods for criticality safety will be identified in particular in support of validation of computational methods required for advanced fuel cycles and recommendations for concrete actions formulated.

#### IV. Meetings, Conferences

22. The group meets once per year to discuss and monitor progress in the international problem exercises and benchmarks and to define a work programme for the following year.

- The next meeting will be held from 27th to 29th September 1995 in Las Vegas. It will be held just after the ICNC'95 Conference and the Expert meeting on future needs in Criticality Experiments.
- A seminar on SCALE-4 and Related Modular Systems for the Evaluation of Nuclear Facilities and Package Design Featuring Criticality, Shielding and Heat Transfer Capabilities was organised by NEA in 1992

23. A series of inferences in criticality safety were in Los Alamos (1981), Valduc/Dijon (1985), Tokyo (1988) and Oxford:

- Fourth International Conference on Nuclear Criticality Safety - ICNC'91 Oxford, 9th to 13th September 1991

It was attended by 170 specialists from 26 countries and 2 international organisations, including for the first time experts from Russia.

24. The next one will be the

- Fifth International Conference on Nuclear Criticality Safety - ICNC'95 to be held in Albuquerque, New Mexico, from 18th to 22nd September 1995.
- A conference on the Safety of the Nuclear Fuel Cycle scheduled for October 1995 in Japan is co-sponsored by the NEA.

ANNEX IList of Working Group MembersNSC Burnup Credit Criticality Benchmark Meeting

OECD, Chateau de la Muette, 11th to 13th July 1994

**BELGIUM**

MALDAGUE, Thierry	Tel.	+32 (2) 774 0630
Belgonucleaire S.A.	Fax	+32 (2) 774 0614
Avenue Ariane 4		
B-1200 BRUXELLES		

**FRANCE**

* ALBAREDE, Pierre	Tel.	+33 42 25 79 16
C.E.N. - Cadarache	Fax	+33 42 25 48 49
Bat. 230		
CEA/DEDR/DRP/SPRC		
F-13108 ST. PAUL LEZ DURANCE CEDEX		
MAUBERT, Louis	Tel.	+33 (1) 46 54 74 30
CEA/IPSN/DRS/SEC	Fax	+33 (1) 46 57 29 98
CEN Fontenay-aux-Roses		
B.P. No. 6		
F-92265 FONTENAY-AUX-ROSES		
NOURI, Ali	Tel.	+33 46 54 89 15
C.E.A.	Fax	+33 46 57 29 98
IPSN/DRS/SEC		
B.P. No 6		
92265 FONTENAY AUX ROSES CEDEX		
POULLOT, Gilles	Tel.	+33 (1) 46 54 74 21
CEA/IPSN/DRS/SEC	Fax	+33 (1) 46 57 29 98
CEN Fontenay-aux-Roses		
B.P. No. 6		(Main Contact for France)
F-92265 FONTENAY-AUX-ROSES		
ROQUE, Benedicte	Tel.	+33 42 25 36 48
C.E. - Cadarache	Fax	+33 42 25 48 49
CEA/DRN/DER, Bat. 230		
F-13108 ST. PAUL LEZ DURANCE CEDEX		
SANTAMARINA, Alain	Tel.	+33 42 25 70 46
C.E. - Cadarache,	Fax	+33 42 25 48 49
CEA/DRN/DER, Bat. 230		
F-13108 ST. PAUL LEZ DURANCE CEDEX		

**GERMANY**

GMAL, Bernhard	Tel.	+49 (89) 32004 194
Gesellschaft fuer Anlagen- und Reaktorsicherheit	Fax	+49 (89) 32004 191
Forschungsgelaende D-85748 GARCHING		
SCHWEER, Hans Heinrich	Tel.	+49 (531) 592 7685
Bundesamt fuer Strahlenschutz	Fax	+49 (531) 592 7616
Albert Schweitzerst. 18 Postfach 100149 D-38226 SALZGITTER		

**ITALY**

* LANDEYRO, Pedro	Tel.	+39 (6) 30 48 40 51
ENEA-DRI/COMB	Fax	+39 (6) 30 48 48 64
CRE Casaccia S.P. Anguillarese, 301 00100 ROMA A.D.		
* SICILIANO, Francesco	Tel.	+39 (835) 974 213
ENEA - Centro Comb Trisaia	Fax	+39 (835) 974 292
S.S. 106 Jonica, Km 419+500 I-75025 POLICORO (Matera)		

**JAPAN**

* ANDO, Yoshihira	Tel.	+81 (44) 288 8132
Nuclear Engineering Lab.	Fax	+81 (44) 299 2853
Toshiba Corporation 4-1 Ukishima-cho, Kawasaki-ku KAWASAKI 210		
* MITAKE, Susumu	Tel:	+81 (3) 5470 5470
Japan Institute of	Fax:	+81 (3) 5470 5454
Nuclear Safety Fujita Kankou Toranomom B.7F 3-17-1 TORANOMON Minato-ku, TOKYO 105		
NAITO, Yoshitaka	Tel.	+81 292 82 57 98
Deputy Director	Fax	+81 292 82 61 99
Department of Fuel Cycle Safety Research, JAERI 319-11 Tokai-mura Naka-Gun, Ibaraki-ken		

NOJIRI, Ichiro	Tel.	+81 (292) 82 1111
PNC	Fax	+81 (292) 87 1841
Tokai Works		
Muramatsu Tokai-mura		
Naka-gun IBARAKI-KEN 319-11		
* SUYAMA, Kenya	Tel.	+81 (22) 222 1800 X 4679
Reactor Physics Laboratory	Fax	+81 (22) 268 1539
Dept. of Nuclear Engineering		
University of Tohoku		
Aoba, Aramaki-ku		
SENDAI-SHI 980		
TAKANO, Makoto	Tel.	+81 (292) 82 5943
JAERI	Fax	+81 (292) 82 6479
Fuel Cycle Safety Eval. Lab.		
Tokai Research Establishment		
TOKAI-MURA, Naka-gun		
Ibaraki-ken 319-11		
<b>SPAIN</b>		
CONDE LOPEZ, Jose M.	Tel.	+34 (1) 346 02 53
Head, Nuclear Engineering D.	Fax	+34 (1) 346 05 88
CSN		
Justo Dorado, 11		
28003 MADRID		
<b>SWEDEN</b>		
MENNERDAHL, Dennis	Tel.	+46 (8) 5117 8203
D. Mennerdahl Systems	Fax	+46 (8) 51177233
Pl 457		
S-186 41 VALLENTUNA		
<b>SWITZERLAND</b>		
GRIMM, Peter	Tel.	+41 (56) 99 20 71
Paul Scherrer Institute	Fax	+41 (56) 99 21 99
CH-5232 VILLIGEN PSI		
<b>UNITED KINGDOM</b>		
GULLIFORD, N.T.	Tel.	+44 (305) 251 888 (EXT. 2795)
Department Head, Experimental	Fax	+44 (305) 20 2552
Reactor Physics		
AEA Technology		
Winfrith Technology Centre		
Dorchester, Dorset DT2 8DH		

STEWART, James  
 Department of Transport  
 Radioactive Materials  
 Transport Division S14/19A  
 2 Marsham Street  
 LONDON SW1P 3EB

Tel. +44 (71) 276 0503  
 Fax +44 (71) 276 5945  
 22221 DOEMAR

THORNE, Peter Rex  
 British Nuclear Fuels  
 Safety & Nuclear Technology  
 R112, Rutherford House  
 Risley Warrington WA3 6AS

Tel. +44 (925) 833 004  
 Fax +44 (925) 833 267  
 051000 627581

#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

BRADY, Michael C.  
 Sandia National Laboratory  
 101 Convention Center Drive  
 Suite 880  
 LAS VEGAS, NV 89109

Tel. +1 (702) 794 5139  
 Fax +1 (702) 794 5129

WHITESIDES, G. Elliott **(CHAIR)**  
 Oak Ridge National Labs.  
 P.O. Box 2008  
 Oak Ridge, Tennessee 37830

Tel: +1 (615) 574 5304  
 Fax: +1 (615) 574 9646 OR 4532

#### OECD/Nuclear Energy Agency

SARTORI, Enrico **(SECRETARIAT)**  
 OECD/NEA Data Bank  
 Le Seine-Saint Germain  
 12 boulevard des Iles  
 F-92130 ISSY-LES-MOULINEAUX

Tel: +33 (1) 4524 1072  
 Fax: +33 (1) 4524 1110

\* sent apologies for being unable to attend

**ANNEX II****Bibliography of Work Carried Out****Criticality of Fuel Transport/Storage Packages**

NEACRP-L-326

Standard Problem Exercise on Criticality Codes for Spent LWR Fuel Transport Containers.  
(CSNI Report No. 71) May 1982

NEACRP-L-327

Standard Problem Exercise on Criticality Codes for Large Arrays of Packages of Fissile Materials.  
(Report No. 78) August 1984

**Criticality of Fuel in Dissolution**

NEACRP-A-1029

Understanding the Effect of a Double-heterogeneity on Criticality Calculations and a Method for the Realistic Treatment of the Physics of this Problem, July 1989  
A. Santamarina, H.J. Smith (CEA - Cadarache)

NEACRP-L- 306

Standard Problem Exercise on Criticality Codes for Dissolving Fissile Oxides in Acids. A Report of the NEACRP Criticality Working Group.  
(Editor: G.E. Whitesides), April 1990

NEACRP-L-320.

Analysis of the OECD/NEACRP Problem No. 20 on International Criticality Codes for Fuel Pellets in Fissile Solution, December 1990  
A. Santamarina, H.J. Smith,

NEACRP-L-325

Analysis of the International Criticality Benchmark No. 19 of a Realistic Fuel Dissolver, January 1991  
H.J. Smith, A. Santamarina,

NEACRP Standard Problem Exercise on Criticality Codes for Dissolving Fissile Oxides in Acids. A reference Method for Treating the Fuel Double Heterogeneity, April 1990, Proceedings of PHYSOR'90 Conference, Marseille  
A. Santamarina, H.J. Smith, G.E. Whitesides

Evaluation and Validation of Criticality Codes for Fuel Dissolver Calculations, September 1991, Proceedings of ICNC'91 Conference, Oxford  
A. Santamarina, H. Smith, G.E. Whitesides

**Burnup Credit Criticality**

NEACRP-L- 337

Burnup-Credit Criticality Benchmark  
Phase I-A. Simple PWR Spent Fuel Cell (Problem Specification)  
Makoto TAKANO (JAERI), (Michael BRADY (ORNL))

NSC/DOC(93)- 22

Burnup Credit Criticality Benchmark, Final Results of Phase I-A  
January 1994  
JAERI-M-94-003  
Makoto TAKANO (JAERI)

NSC/DOC(93)- 15

Burnup Credit Criticality Benchmark, Phase II-A: Effect of Axial Burnup  
Profile (Infinite fuel pin array)  
Makoto Takano (JAERI), Michael Brady (SNL), Alain Santamarina (CEA)  
June 1993

NSC/DOC(92)- 10

Burnup-Credit Criticality Benchmark, Part I-B. Isotopic Prediction  
(Problem Specification)  
Draft 30 November 1992  
Michael C. Brady

A report on these activities has been presented by the Chairman of the group  
(G.E. Whitesides) at the different SAGSTRAM Conferences.

**ICSBEP Handbook**

NSC/DOC(95)-3

International Handbook on Evaluated Criticality Safety Benchmark Experiments  
I. Plutonium Systems. II. Highly Enriched Uranium Systems. III. Intermediate  
and Mixed Enrichment Uranium Systems. IV. Low Enriched Uranium Systems. V.  
Uranium 233 Systems. VI. Mixed Plutonium Uranium Systems, Dae Y. Chung (DoE),  
J. Blair Briggs, Lori Scott and June Williams (INEL), May 1995